

PROCEEDINGS OF THE ST. CLOUD HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION

A meeting of the St. Cloud Heritage Preservation Commission was held on October 25, 2011, at 3:30 p.m. in the St. Cloud City Hall Council Chambers. Members present were Bartlow, Berg, Chirhart, Fischer, and Morgan. Lenaghan and SCSU representative Ludwig were absent.

Approval of Minutes: Berg moved to approve the minutes of September 27, 2011. The motion was seconded by Morgan and carried by a vote of 4-0-1 (Chirhart abstaining).

HAP-2011-27/210 3rd St. So.: Carla Chapman, Senior Planner, stated that applicant is requesting an alteration permit to remove the existing wood siding on two detached garages at 210 3rd St. So. and replace it with vinyl siding in a brown color. The Design Manual states that wood siding should be maintained with paint stains but allows for the following three exceptions: 1) if the wood is significantly deteriorated; 2) resurfacing of non-contributing buildings constructed after 1940; and, 3) when the garage is inconspicuously sited. Staff recommended that applicant consider other siding materials with the preference being that the existing wood be repainted or rained. The Alteration Permit Subcommittee recommended allowing 4" vinyl lap siding in Mocha color. Chirhart said he did not attend the Subcommittee meeting and asked for an explanation of the rationale for the recommendation to allow vinyl siding. Morgan stated that he looked at the garages, and the siding is in terrible condition. Also, there is no real connection to the neighborhood from these garages. Berg stated that the Committee talked about the difference between vertical and horizontal siding. The vertical siding was in bad condition; the horizontal siding looked good to the Committee. Chairperson Bartlow added that the garage building is not historically significant in and of itself. Chirhart moved to approve the request for the alteration permit subject to the condition that the vinyl siding be 4" lap in Mocha color. The motion was seconded by Fischer, and the motion carried unanimously.

HAP-2011-28/515 St. Germain St. W.: Carla Chapman, Senior Planner, stated that the Historic Sites Inventory File states that the building at 515 St. Germain St. W. is a commercial building located in the St. Cloud Commercial Historic District and is a contributing property. The file also states that it is a simple commercial brick building of comparatively modest design and contributes to the historic fabric of downtown St. Cloud. Applicant is proposing to replace the upper four windows on the front façade as well as the upper windows on the rear façade. Applicant is also proposing to replace the two steel doors above the fire escape as well as the two windows located above the steel doors on the rear façade. Chapman stated that the window openings on the upper front facade are currently horizontal sliding glass with a panel inset in the upper portion. Staff believes the original building might have had full length windows. The existing windows were probably installed in the 1970s. Originally, applicant had requested replacing the existing windows on the front façade with horizontal sliding windows and a glass transom. However, applicant found a historic photo and altered the proposal to a center picture window flanked by two vertical windows. On the rear façade, applicant is proposing to replace the two steel doors and paint them red to match the doors on the lower façade, frame in the transom window, and also replace the upper windows with double hung windows with a fixed transom in a sandalwood color. In consideration of the revised front façade proposal, Staff recommends approval of the request with the condition that the approved window plan is the only approved installation plan for the building and that any other changes will require Planning & Zoning staff approval and/or HPC review and approval. Fischer moved to approve the Subcommittee recommendation and Staff recommendations per the revised drawing. Fischer asked if some changes can be made to the recommendation if the revised drawing results in a much higher cost. Chapman stated that minor adjustments can be approved administratively. Morgan seconded the motion. Bartlow asked what kind of material is proposed for the front façade and questioned the color choice of the steel doors on the rear façade. Rebekah Glasmann, representing the property owner, answered that they will try to use wood with metal clad on the windows which would be close to the original material. Morgan stated that finding the historic photo was very valuable and likes the

proposed windows. Chapman suggested that the motion be revised to include the conditions that the windows on the upper façade of the front elevation will be commercial grade in metal clad in a neutral color and the steel doors and transoms above the door on the rear elevation be painted in a neutral color. Bartlow said she believes the front windows should be metal clad and in a neutral color; and, any deviation from that would require applicant to come back to staff for approval. The motion carried unanimously.

HAP-2011-29/395 2nd Ave. So.: Carla Chapman, Senior Planner, stated that applicant is requesting an alteration permit to construct a freestanding sign on the property at 395 2nd Ave. So. The existing apartment building was constructed in 2000 and is a non-contributing property. The 1999 Southside Neighborhood Historic Study states that nearly all the houses on 2nd Ave. have been converted to student housing. However, she noted that Lutheran Student Housing, adjacent to applicant's property, is a contributing property. In addition, nearby 3rd Ave. So. is the primary north/south spine of the historic district with multiple national register properties located along it. The Design Manual states that signs should be compatible with the character of the building and the surrounding area. It also states that signs should be appropriately sized and complementary to the building's exterior. Chapman noted that since the Alteration Permit Subcommittee meeting last week, a revised sign proposal has been submitted by applicant. Applicant altered the color of the sign posts as he would prefer that they not be white for maintenance purposes. Chapman stated that Staff finds the burnt orange color for the sign posts compatible with the neighborhood. The Subcommittee made a similar recommendation but asked that the sign posts and balls at the top of the posts be white, that the lettering be a serif typeface, and that the height of the sign be limited to 8' or less. Fischer moved approval of applicant's preferred sign on the revised sign proposal (with burnt orange posts) subject to the condition that the height of the sign be limited to 8' or less. The motion was seconded by Berg. Bartlow commented that she prefers the white sign posts but that she would agree to the orange color. The motion carried unanimously.

2010/2011 HPC Annual Report: Chapman explained that an annual report must be submitted to the State Historic Preservation Office in order to maintain CLG status. She stated that there was no survey or inventory work done and no designations made in 2011. HPC efforts focused on public outreach. One of the projects for 2012 is to update and improve the City's HPC website. Morgan moved approval of the 2010/2011 HPC Annual Report, and Berg seconded the motion. Chirhart noted that it is a very professional looking document. The motion to approve carried unanimously.

Other Business: Chapman stated that since the last meeting, there have been a number of requests that were approved administratively. A permit was approved for the Middlestadt property at 402 6th Ave. So. for reroofing of the attached garage. Staff just received supplemental information on a permit request from Rick Thienes for the Clarke House at 356 3rd Ave. So. to reroof using in-kind materials and has proposed to replace steel gutters with copper gutters. Staff recommended using a product that expedites oxidation so that it becomes a dark black color quicker. Thienes stated that he will consider it; however, only 5" of copper will be seen from the street level. Lillian's, a retail shop at 824 St. Germain St. requested a new sign. There were also two other reroof applications for the Southside Neighborhood Historic District.

Adjournment: There being no further business, Berg moved to adjourn the meeting. The meeting was adjourned at 3:49 p.m.

Bill Morgan, Secretary